

Ann Buckley (ed.) *Music, Liturgy, and the Veneration of Saints of the Medieval Irish Church in a European Context*. Ritus et Artes, 8. Turnhout: Brepols, 2017. xxxiv+359 pp., 15 b/w ill. + 7 colour ill. + 30 Music Examples, 1 Map, 14 b/w tables. ISBN 978-2-503-53470-1, e-ISBN: 978-2-503-54020-7

This very handsome volume is dedicated to the memory of Michel Huglo (1921–2012) whose essay stands in first place in the book. The debt to him of all who are involved in medieval music and liturgy is profound.

As the editor to the volume points out, this publication was carefully planned. Two symposia were held at St Patrick's College Maynooth and Maynooth University: the first, in April 2006, was in association with the National Centre for Liturgy and the Society for Musicology in Ireland, and had as its theme, 'Music and liturgy of the medieval Irish Church'; the second, in November 2007, examined *Historiae* for Irish saints at home and abroad. The papers delivered at the symposia were reworked for publication, and one by Bernhard Hangartner and the other by Pieter Mannaerts were added subsequently. In her wide ranging and masterly introduction, Ann Buckley states:

‘... one of the primary motivations for this present publication [...] is to challenge the isolated position of scholarship on the music and liturgy of the medieval Irish Church and to restore it to its rightful place on the European historical map. Our aim is to broaden the base for discussion of this aspect of medieval Irish cultural history in its regional and insular contexts, and relatedly, of the impact and legacy of the medieval Irish diaspora in continental Europe, through an examination of the cults of Irish saints.’

She raises the problem of the 'Celtic Rite' and the belief that the Norman invasion smothered all traces of an earlier culture. Since Rome did not conquer Ireland the country was seen to remain outside the developments that took place in Europe in the Early Middle Ages. As she points out, this view is not unique to music and liturgy studies. Since the vernacular literature of Ireland is voluminous, and since the language and associated

mythology allowed scholars to delve into the Indo-European past, it was not unnatural that Celtic Scholars concentrated on Ireland itself. This reinforced the otherness of Ireland in relation to early medieval Europe. Those who studied the Normans in Ireland were dealing with new sources that were mostly in Latin and Norman French, and for them the Norman world was seen to sit on top of or alongside an early, if not backward, conservative culture. Buckley explores these ideas against the positions adopted by the nationalist and romantic scholars of the nineteenth century and those who came from an Anglican, Protestant and colonial background. As she points out, most scholars no longer hold such ideas and the publication of this collection of essays is timely since the divide between Celtic and Norman scholarship has been greatly eroded to the benefit of both.

The ‘Romanisation’ of Ireland was intensified with the coming of Christianity and, by the seventh century, contact with Rome brought differences to the fore. It was not that the Irish were heretical but that they had traditions that went back to a very early period in the life of the Christian church. Studies of Irish chant would suggest that the Irish preserved traces of an older practice once widespread in western Europe — a tradition that stretched beyond the time of Gregory the Great.

‘Lives’ of the saints were a rich source for the saint’s Office. These ‘lives’ are increasingly explored by historians but, as volume the editor points out, there are details in the liturgical manuscripts that are not found in the ‘lives’ — providing a rich store of information that has yet to be properly investigated by historians. These are the themes that are explored in the various sections of the book.

The first section begins with ‘Chant in the Early Irish Church’. It is followed by others: ‘Issues of Time and Place’; ‘Offices of the Saints’ that has subsections dealing with sources on the Continent, in Ireland, in Scotland and Wales, and with a final section, ‘Liturgy: Theory and Practice’.

In ‘A study of early Irish chant’ Michel Huglo looks to liturgical psalters in Irish script, the Antiphonary of Bangor, the Stowe Missal, as well as other manuscript sources. In the Irish *Liber Hymnorum* he finds the ‘oldest attestation of the *versus*, a liturgical genre found in Gaul in the *versus* of Venantius Fortunatus (d. 600), and later in those of Ratpert and Hartmann of St Gall’. He notes that the psalters in Irish script, from Ireland or Scotland, are divided into three fifties, following Gallican practice. He agrees with Bannister that the version of the seven biblical canticles was Vulgate and followed the Roman Office of Lauds introduced to Canterbury by Augustine — therefore finding their way into Irish psalters only during the course of the seventh century. The antiphon *De caelis Dominum laudate* in the Antiphonary of Bangor is addressed to Christ following the practice in Gallican sacramentaries. Again ‘the Gallican origin of the antiphon *Crucem sanctam subiit* implies that the Irish antiphons composed to the same melodic pattern are indeed Gallican in origin’.

Since it has been possible to recover the common melody type used in alleluistic antiphons from the Gregorian repertory, Huglo suggests that the three alleluistic Communion antiphons of the Antiphonary of Bangor were sung to the same melody. A further category of alleluistic antiphons is found in fragments of a Gallican antiphonary written in Irish script of the eighth century, again providing connections between the chant of Ireland and Gaul. The Antiphonary of Bangor also contains the *Gloria in excelsis Deo* (copied from a Gallican exemplar, according to Klaus Gamber) and *Te Deum*, and is the oldest witness to these ancient prose hymns. In his examination of the text of the *Te Deum* Huglo notes that the line ‘*Tu Patris sempiternus es Filius*’ was cited in the treatise, *Musica enchiriadis* (end of ninth century), ‘to illustrate the theory of parallel organum at the fourth or fifth and (in Chapter XIV) that of an *organum duplum*’. He speculates that this organum may have been chosen to explain the manner

of singing heterophony — ‘an example taken from a very old practice well known from Europe to the Caucasus ...’.

His conclusion is that Old Gallican chant was the primary source for early Irish chant and that it may have been by way of Irish foundations on the Continent that snatches of the Irish repertory could have been recopied into some Italian manuscripts. Huglo claims (2) that St Patrick had extensive contact with the churches of Gaul, perhaps with Poitiers. The evidence is extremely slim but Huglo’s suggestion may have strong support in a recent argument that Patrick did indeed spend time in Gaul.¹

In her ‘Proper Offices for Saints and the *Historia*: their history and historiography, and the case of the *Historia* for St Livinus’, Barbara Hagg-Huglo states,

‘The hundreds of saints’ offices, which give witness to an evolving understanding of melodic composition and notation in the main genres of the chant repertory, the antiphons and responsories, and throughout the Middle Ages, deserve better consideration’.

In a very important discussion she looks at historiographical problems — the question of terminology and periodization. In the aftermath of the Viking invasions, churches used the cults of the saints to safeguard their possessions and attract worshippers. It was a period during which the discovery, invention (of the history both of saints and their foundations) and proliferation of relics gathered pace. The arrival, translation or invention of a saint’s relics was an occasion for a new Proper Office. The rise of Marian devotion, canonization, and the emergence of new religious orders brought about further changes. Some of this activity was political and diplomatic. The evolution of the Office, she suggests, parallels developments in architecture in the proliferation of side chapels and the

¹ Michael W. Herren, ‘Patrick, Gaul, and Gildas: a new lens on the apostle of Ireland’s career’, in Sarah Sheehan, Joanne Findon and Westley Follett (eds), *Gablánach in scélaigeacht: Celtic Studies in Honour of Ann Dooley* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2013), pp. 9–25. Sara Casey, less controversially, suggests Palladius as the link in her contribution (p. 79).

subsequent need for relics. The *historiae* and *vitae* often found in hagiographical *libelli* are now found in a new type of book — the breviary. She continues with an examination of ‘Catalogues, editions, and complexity’. She moves to a discussion of composers, and suggests that ‘we can and should attempt to recover the names of composers of the medieval monophonic as well as polyphonic repertory, rather than hide their unique accomplishments in “repertories”’. The possibility of applying ‘music criticism’ to medieval chant is considered and the very important discussion of the relationship between ‘creation’ and ‘composition’ is confronted. The discussion thus far presents challenges for all scholars involved in this area. The chapter ends with an examination of the *Historia* for St Livinus of Ghent. This saint was ‘meticulously invented’ and is the patron saint of Ghent to this day — a cult that spread to eastern Europe. Livinus, as with others in the volume, was given an Irish ancestry, showing that the prestige of Irish saints was of importance long after their heyday on the Continent.

Nils Holger Petersen discusses ‘Locality and distance in cults of saints in medieval Norway’. Specifically he examines the cult of Sunniva, the national saint of Norway. As was the case of Livinus just mentioned, she too, despite having a name that is possibly Anglo-Saxon in origin, was given a noble ancestry in Ireland. Following a discussion of the legend of the saint, its evolution and the question of dating, and using this as a springboard, Professor Petersen launches into an investigation of ‘cultural memory and the cult of saints’. This section ends with a reference to the insights of Gunilla Iversen into the construction of the Office of St Olav and the succession of new Offices that followed. Petersen’s important discussion of cultural memory might be read against Jon Gunnar Jørgensen’s recent examination of the ‘cult’ of Olav — a work that would reinforce his ideas.² In conclusion Professor Petersen points out that the

² Jon Gunnar Jørgensen, ‘Óláfr Haraldsson, king, warrior and saint: presentations of King Óláfr Haraldsson the saint in medieval poetry and prose’, in Jan Erik Rekdal and Charles Doherty, *Kings and warriors in early north-west Europe* (Four Courts Press: Dublin, 2016), pp. 345–98.

invention of a saint was not simply cynicism. ‘In the case of Sunniva, we are dealing with the beginning of a medieval Christian culture in eleventh-century Norway where it was of importance to establish a Christian cultural memory.’

Jean-Michel Picard’s paper, ‘*Omnes sancti chori Hiberniae sanctorum orate pro nobis*: manuscript evidence for the cult of Irish saints in medieval Europe’ concludes with the statement: ‘Cults are living organisms: they are not static, and each generation has to ensure that the tradition is preserved and cherished by their successors’. His paper reinforces a theme that has been consistently expressed in the previous papers. While the cult of St Colum Cille had virtually disappeared in fifteenth-century France, ‘the commemoration of the saint *in cappis* supposes an older tradition — and manuscript exemplars — where Colum Cille was celebrated as an important saint’. Picard goes on to discuss the cult of Irish saints in Breton circles clearly visible from the tenth century onward. Reims emerges from his discussion as an important centre for the diffusion of Irish saints’ cults — as are the scriptoria of Liège, Laon, Soissons, Corbie, Fleury, Orléans and Tours where Bretons and Irishmen worked side by side, as glosses in both Breton and Irish attest, including glosses in Breton translated from earlier Irish material. And, indeed, so close were the two parties (including Anglo-Saxons) that they were, on occasion, all lumped together by the natives! The cults of Brigit and Fursa are also discussed, throwing a flood of light upon Irish activity on the Continent in the transmission of ‘lives’ and the continued inclusion of material from them in liturgical documents. While the cult of Brigit (because of her power over fertility and lactation) became universal, many communities made the cults of other Irish saints their own.

Sara G. Casey returns to the theme of chant in ‘Songs for the *peregrini*: propers for Irish saints in Continental manuscripts’. She points to ‘several melodic features that scholars have ascribed to Gallican chant: these include the use of formulaic and repetitive structures. In addition,

a particular neume, the *pes stratus*, is frequently found in a rising cadence'. This last is found in Gaul before and immediately after the Gregorian reform. In an attempt to find traces of Irish chant on the Continent she examined nineteen chants for the Irish *Peregrini* using three musical characteristics: 1) Stäblein in 1972 — repetition of melodic formulae or cells; 2) Brannon 1990 — melodies that had frequent intervals of a third; and 3) Casey 2000 — an alternating *virga* and *punctum* (Drummond Missal). These studies suggested that the features were characteristic of Irish chant. She then compared her findings with chants for Irish saints in Insular manuscripts which suggested 'a common chant tradition, whether "Irish" as posited by Stäblein or "Gallican" as described by Huglo and Cullin, or indeed representing a common tradition'.

Her analysis was extended to a further seventy-five chants in the Gregorian reperory to determine whether or not these characteristics were unique to the Irish or Gallican traditions. The results would seem to confirm previous studies that suggest 'that a large portion of chants found in the Gregorian tradition were taken directly from the Gallican repertory'.

In all of the 'non-Irish' chants examined, it was in the genre of sequence that the three characteristics occurred, reinforcing 'the theory of their origin in the oral, prenotated tradition, and emphasiz[ing] their connection with Gallican, and also Irish, practices'. These West-Frankish sequences were most likely from Jumièges and, given the Irish presence there, 'it is not impossible that the early sequence as sung in West Francia was, in part, a reflection of continuing Irish influence'.

Bernhard Hangartner's chapter is a study of 'The *Historia* of St Fintan of Rheinau'. This contribution is accompanied by seven beautiful plates of manuscript pages. Following a brief account of the history of the monastery of Rheinau, the author presents a synopsis of the life of Fintan to his canonization about the year 1000, along with the dedicatory image in the Rheinau Gradual depicting the saint when his cult (that was always to remain local) was at its height around 1200. The six manuscripts

containing the *historia* are then described with a collation of the evidence. A discussion of the structure and transmission of the *historia* follows. A final section, 'From neumes to Hufnagel notation — modal structure — melodies', brings the chapter to a close. The structure is planned and regular. 'While the almost completely unrhymed prose structure of the text provides an older foundation for the musical superstructure, the often syllabic musical setting of the antiphons and a rather more melismatic one for the responsories confirm this essential feature of a 'classical' nature. [...] Along with the clearly modal ordering of the chants, and the 'conventionally classical', there are also a few elements which speak for a qualified 'modern' style'.

Pieter Mannaerts examines the cult of St Dymphna: '*Letetur Hybernia, jubilans Antverpia: the chant and cult of St Dymphna of Gheel*'. This is a detailed study of a cult for which there is a surprising amount of information. As with other saints already discussed, St Dymphna's origins are traced to Ireland with the similar purpose of providing her with an orthodox and secure spiritual lineage. The unlikely link can be traced to at least 1658 and probably was made much earlier. A radio-carbon examination of the contents of her shrine revealed three thigh bones of individuals who died at the same time, probably in the eighth century, and likely represented a female and a male. Her *Vita* was based on an earlier Dutch account and oral tradition from about 1247. It claimed she was an Irish princess. Rejecting her father's advances following the death of her mother, she fled with her confessor to Antwerp and then to Gheel. Followed by her obsessed father she again refused his advances. His men killed the confessor and she was decapitated by her deranged father with his own sword allegedly on 30 May 600. As a result of this act she became the patron saint of the mentally ill. A hospital for the mentally ill was dedicated to the Virgin and Dymphna in 1286 and continued to flourish.

By the mid sixteenth century the church of St Dymphna, now raised to the rank of collegiate church in 1562, celebrated a proper liturgy. While

the existing sources for the liturgy are late, Mannaerts shows that Antwerp was an important centre for the formation of a Proper Office in the fifteenth century. So attractive was the cult of Dymphna that she appears as a character in works of fiction and drama in the seventeenth century — and there is much more in this fascinating study.

Ann Buckley's important and thought-provoking contribution is, 'From Hymn to *Historia*: liturgical veneration of local saints in the medieval Irish Church'. She points out that no full offices for Irish and non-Irish saints survive in Irish manuscripts from earlier than the thirteenth century. It would seem that 'only individual hymns, collects, and occasional antiphons were composed in honour of local saints in pre-Norman Ireland'. Prose *historiae* as found in Carolingian Francia are not found here either. Following the great plague in 664 there was a rise in interest in national and local cults. The Book of Armagh is of fundamental importance for the cult of Patrick. As previous chapters have indicated the Antiphonary of Bangor and the *Liber Hymnorum* are at the forefront of the study of hymns. An early liturgical context for hymns is to be found in the Book of Mulling and the Basel Psalter (both eighth century). The Basel Psalter contains what may be the earliest source (unique to this manuscript) to bring both saints Patrick and Brigit together, that is the hymn, *Alta audite ta ep̄sa* — in praise of St Brigit. Indeed it might tentatively be dated to c. 700 by which time Armagh and Kildare had reached an accommodation, and could possibly be a reflection of that.

Unique to the Antiphonary of Bangor is *Recordemur iustitiae*, a hymn for St Comgall. Interestingly Buckley points out that a fragment of it has been found on a slate from the excavations on Inchmarnock in the Firth of Clyde showing two lines one beneath the other containing the lines *Adeptus sanctum premium* with orthographical errors which suggest a student practising. Of great interest too is the way in which a more formal style is used for the texts of the hymns in Latin in the *Liber Hymnorum* whereas the collects and Irish hymns are written in a narrower and more

‘pointy’ script. ‘And while this feature does not occur in the copy preserved in F [OFM-UCD MS A2], it nonetheless affords insight into the way the scribes (and the students/singers) thought about the material: ‘hymn proper’ and ‘other.’ There is also an interesting discussion of the relationship between ‘lives’ and the liturgy.

Senan Furlong discusses ‘The medieval office of St Patrick’. The author suggests that this sadly neglected office ‘originated most probably in an Anglo-Norman milieu’. He begins by providing an overview of the history and hagiography of St Patrick. This is followed by a background to the Office. It is suggested that the promotion of the cult of St Patrick by the Norman Sir John de Courcy, First Earl of Ulster, may provide the motivation for its creation. The manuscript sources — those with staff notation and those without — are listed and described. The content and form are discussed. It would seem to have been for secular and not monastic use. Between the tenth and eleventh centuries there was a gradual shift from the traditional prose composition so that by the mid-twelfth century poetry predominated — ‘The Office of Patrick is a hybrid of prose, rhymed prose, and rhymed accentual verse components’.

The author of the Office relied heavily on the hymn, *Ecce fulget clarissima*, probably originating in North Munster before its transmission via St James at Regensburg to Vienna. Furlong traces the evolution of the Office. ‘In fact, between the end of the thirteenth and the end of the fifteenth century, all the material in this Office, with the exception of the antiphon *Veneranda imminentis*, was replaced with new Proper items’. Much of this activity, including the desire to give greater prominence to First Vespers, is traced to the constitutions promulgated by Alexander de Bicknor, Archbishop of Dublin c. 1320. The author also traces the text of the lections to the various ‘lives’ of St Patrick. This study is a valuable contribution to the cult of St Patrick.

Patrick Brannon examines another Office in his chapter, ‘A divine office celebration for the feast of St Canice at Kilkenny cathedral’. This

office is found in Trinity College Dublin MS 78, a late fifteenth-century Sarum Antiphonal commonly known as the ‘Clondalkin Breviary’. ‘The inclusion of a full Office for the celebration of the feast of Canice appears to be a particularly Irish accretion to the Sarum liturgy’. There follows a description of the manuscript. The kalendar has especial importance in giving information about many aspects of MS 78. It includes thirty-seven English saints in the original hand. Two are in red: Thomas of Canterbury and George. There are thirty-three Irish saints recorded and four are in red: Brigit, Ciarán, Patrick and Canice, suggesting a strong Irish presence in the place of origin of the manuscript. The texts in the Office were set in rhymed verse while the melodies were adapted and reworked from common melodic materials. A further analysis arrives at the conclusion: ‘Thus it is conceivable that MS 78, with its many Irish saints and a noted Office for Canice, reflects a significant Irish influence, despite statutes prohibiting Irish ecclesiastical appointments and interaction between Irish and Anglo-Normans’. And such interaction was most likely in late medieval Kilkenny.³

The next section deals with offices of the saints in Scotland and Wales. The first essay is by Betty I. Knott, ‘Possible Irish influences in the office for St Kentigern, patron saint of Glasgow’. This Office is found in the Sprouston Breviary (Edinburgh, National Library of Scotland, Adv. MS 18.2. 13B), of probable Scottish provenance and dated to the late thirteenth or early fourteenth century. It is suggested that a source for the Office was written in the kind of Irish Latin that is found in the seventh-century *Hisperica Famina*. Jocelin of Furness had written the ‘life’ of Kentigern in the twelfth century and used a source written in *stilo scottico* which he censured for being ‘full of solecisms’. ‘The impression one gets is that the whole thing has been put together from various sources without

³ There are two articles that might be of use in future study of this very important topic. Charles Doherty, ‘Cluain Dolcáin: a brief note’, in Alfred P. Smyth (ed.), *Seanchas: studies in early and medieval Irish archaeology, history and literature in honour of Francis J. Byrne* (Four Courts Press: Dublin, 2000), pp. 182–88; John Bradley, ‘Pulp facts and core fictions: translating a cathedral from Aghaboe to Kilkenny’, in Emer Purcell, Paul MacCotter, Julianne Nyhan and John Sheehan (eds), *Clerics, Kings and Vikings: Essays on medieval Ireland in honour of Donnchadh Ó Corráin* (Four Courts Press: Dublin, 2015), pp. 169–84.

much concern for consistency or overall effect. Elements in the musical settings suggest the same thing'. Indeed it would seem that material was taken from at least two pre-existent offices. Greek and poetic and rare Latin words are used. This vocabulary is analysed in detail and at least twenty-two words occur in the *Hisperica Famina* indicating the Irish influence suggested in the title of the paper.

Staying with Scotland Greta-Mary Hair asks the questions, 'Why St Andrew? Why not St Columba as patron saint of Scotland?' This paper is short but important in showing how powerful cults of the saints could be in secular and ecclesiastical politics. Hair points out that 'The prestige and political advantage attached to a church in possession of the relics of an apostle can scarcely be overestimated'. The cult of St Peter spread throughout Scotland following the Synod of Whitby in 664. Hair outlines the rise of the cult of St Andrew at Constantinople and Europe. As brother of St Peter the relics of St Andrew were highly valued. In the late eleventh century the Scottish church was under threat from the Archbishop of York and, referring to Dauvit Broun, Hair points to the foundation-legend of St Andrews as a justification for archiepiscopal status for that church, and by the late twelfth century she was declared a 'Special Daughter' of Rome. The Apostle Andrew was adopted as the nation's protector and the city of St Andrews was called a 'Second Rome'. 'The decision concerning Scotland's patron saint appears to have been politically astute, and the outcome for Scotland in the twelfth century especially lucky'. It is unlikely that the choice of Columba would have produced the same results.

The cult of St Brendan spans all of the Celtic countries and is examined by Ciaran O'Driscoll in 'Reconstructing first vespers for the feast of St Brendan, abbot of Clonfert, from the common office of a confessor abbot, according to the Sarum rite'. St Brendan is placed in the category of Confessor Abbot. One of the few Proper texts to survive for St Brendan is the Latin hymn, *Iam Brendani*, which survives in the Warmund Psalter, a manuscript from Ivrea written in an 11th-century hand. Dreves and

Blume attributed these hymns to the contemporary Guido of Ivrea (d. c. 965) but this is not proven.⁴

O’Driscoll gave himself a most interesting task of describing the process of reconstructing the Office of First Vespers: ‘It is possible to reassemble almost all the elements known to have been contained in this medieval Office for the feast of St Brendan according to Sarum Use by selecting the music for the Office of a Confessor Abbot from the *Ant[iphonale]S[arisburensis]* and consulting and, where necessary, transcribing relevant texts such as the six Proper lections from the Aberdeen Breviary together with the complementary lections, seven to nine, from the Common of a Confessor Bishop in the *Breviarium* — and additional information from Frere’s two-volume *Use of Sarum*. His aim as he points out, ‘was not to produce a definitive edition which replicates exactly the Office which was performed in the thirteenth century, but rather to create an edition close to such an ideal.’

The final chapter in this section deals with Wales: Sally Harper, ‘Shaping an “indigenous” liturgy: the case for medieval Wales’. Liturgical manuscripts from Wales are few due to the ravages of war and the iconoclasts of the Reformation. Harper’s aim in the chapter is to ‘make a brief exploration of the liturgical materials that may have been used in Wales prior to the arrival of the Normans’, and secondly, to examine ‘the gradual shaping of a new liturgical pattern at one institution, St Davids, from the early thirteenth century’. It is so difficult to recover early Welsh history but it is clear that great churches such as Llantwit Major, St Davids and Llanbadarn Fawr were important centres of learning with scriptoria. Llanbadarn Fawr produced books in the eleventh century. Sulien (1011–91), who had spent years studying in Ireland, and his sons were at the

⁴ Clemens Blume and Guido Maria (eds), *Dreves Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi.*, 55 vols, (Leipzig: Reisland 1887–1922), VIII, no. 88.

forefront of this activity. Irish influence is clear in most of their works and indeed can be traced from the earliest period.

Interestingly it would appear that the Welsh clung on to very archaic practices. The *Liber Commonei* of the ninth century has two sets of parallel-column Greek and Latin lections. This takes us back before the reforms of Gregory the Great. With the domination of the Welsh church by the Normans, reform of the liturgy began in the late eleventh century under the umbrella of Canterbury. The arrival of the Cistercian and Benedictine orders intensified the changes. Harper studies these changes in light of the activity at St Davids where Sarum Use was introduced gradually from 1224 onwards, although there are hints that older practice continued. The reforms of Bishop Adam Houghton in the fourteenth century brought slovenly practices to an end and laid sound foundations for all aspects of the liturgy. Harper concludes by urging scholars to learn more about liturgical materials in the other Celtic countries, especially Ireland.

The final section of the book is entitled 'Liturgy: theory and practice'. The first essay is by Patricia M. Rumsey, 'The significance of the *Liturgia Horarium* in the *Nauigatio sancti Brendani* in its modelling of a sacramental Christian life'. This is a fascinating discussion. The *Nauigatio* makes a point of showing that Compline is not part of the liturgy in the Otherworld. This leads to an exploration of 'the understanding shown in the text of the *Liturgia Horarium* as the interface between this world of time and the 'eternal liturgy taking place in the heavens', and of Compline as the exception which manifests this understanding'. Rumsey provides an overview of the origins and development of Compline. Compline is a completion of the offices of the day, expression of repentance for sins, preparation of sleep as an image of death' and prayers for a peaceful sleep; and, in a way, a duplication of Vespers. It is the contention of the author that 'far from "duplicating Vespers", the hour of Compline, at least in the early West, had a clear theology of its own'. Early scholars were inclined to date its inclusion in the *cursus* in the ninth century. The date of the

Nauigatio has been contentious and Rumsey comes down on the side of those who now suggest a date of c. 800, leading her to suggest that it bears witness to Compline being part of the daily *cursus* possibly as early as the mid eighth century. The author of the *Nauigatio* shows that Compline has no place in the liturgy of the heavens — sin, sleep, death, night do not exist there — but is firmly anchored in this world.

Neil Xavier O'Donoghue investigates 'The use of the Eucharistic chrismal in pre-Norman Ireland'. The author addresses the 'issue which does seem to have been a particular Eucharistic practice in pre-Norman Ireland: the use of the chrismal for the reservation of the Eucharistic bread outside of the context of the liturgical celebration of the Eucharist'. A chrismal was a vessel containing the holy chrism. In the Irish context the *Chrismale* is clearly shown in the sources as a vessel for carrying the Eucharistic Host and was carried around an ecclesiastic's neck — a custom known only in Ireland. In the early church, Communion could be received at home but faded by the fifth century.

It is in Ireland that the practice of carrying the Eucharist on the person continued, but not for bringing Communion to the home. In Patristic sources the 'use of the Eucharist outside of the context of liturgical celebration was a secondary effect. However in the Irish texts it seems that protection was the primary goal of the practice of reservation in the chrismal, and the liturgical context of the *viaticum*, while important, was secondary'. Lives of the saints and penitentials are examined to demonstrate the use of the chrismal in Ireland, showing that its main function was that of talisman. Two surviving chrismals from the Continent survive — one of leather and the other a house-shaped reliquary — providing a hint of what an Irish chrismal might have looked like had any survived. But some may indeed have survived since O'Donoghue suggests (which is very likely) that some of the house-shaped shrines with rings in

the gables for hanging around the neck ‘may possibly be chrismals and not reliquaries in the usual sense of that word’.⁵

The book is brought to a conclusion with a chapter by Liam Tracey, ‘Celtic mists: the search for a Celtic Rite’. Tracey addresses themes that are alluded to or discussed in almost every previous chapter. Taking his cue from the important observations of Thomas O’Loughlin (to whom he returns on a number of occasions), he writes, ‘It is my contention in this chapter that much of what has been written about early Irish liturgy reflects more the concerns and preoccupations of the writer than the actual material that they are examining. Or to pose the question in another and perhaps simpler way: what were the liturgical practices in Ireland before the twelfth-century reforms?’ Following an examination of what is meant by ‘rite’ he then looks at the way that liturgical scholars have treated early Irish liturgy — the problem of the ‘Celtic Rite’. These are F.E. Warren (1842–1930), Edmund Bishop (1846–1917), Louis Duchesne (1843–1922), A.A. King (1890–1972), Cyrille Vogel (1919–82), Jordi Pinell (1921–97), Michael Curran, David N. Power (1932–2014), and Hugh P. Kennedy. This careful exposition contains thought-provoking observations and is extremely useful in providing a map of the history of the subject. Quoting Próinséas Ní Chatháin (and agreeing with her) that the word ‘Celtic’ should be dispensed with in regard to the British Isles and Ireland, he suggests that the word ‘Gallican’ needs to be used in a more precise way. Recent scholarship suggests that the Romanization of ‘Gallican’ liturgy was much more complex. Attention must be given not only to the work of Italian scholars on the Ambrosian liturgy but also to the work of liturgists who are throwing light on the development of the liturgy itself.

As an historian of early Ireland the essays in this book have thrown a flood of light on an area that I was aware of and into which I dipped with

⁵ An episode in the ‘life’ of Colum Cille by Adamnán is referred to as evidence of the use of the chrismal for protection (footnote 24). It is a reference to protection for a political group and would be reinforced by a reading of Michael Byrnes, ‘The Árd Ciannacht in Adomnán’s *Vita Columbae*: a reflection of Iona’s attitude to the Síl nÁeda Sláine in the late seventh century, in Smyth, *Seanchas*, pp. 127–36.

trepidation on occasion. It really emphasizes that Early Ireland cannot be properly explored without recourse to what was happening in Europe. Ireland was never isolated from Europe and there was movement back and forth. The early Irish, however conservative they may seem, could never have been unaware of innovation on the Continent. As the writing of Columbanus shows, when the Irish became Christian and entered the world of Christendom they felt that their voice was equal to a voice from anywhere else and the idea of their remote position on the very edge of the world was a wonderful conceit. The claims for the book made by the editor are amply fulfilled — it not merely throws light on an aspect of medieval culture but it opens a door and is an invitation to enter. The misprints are extremely few and the book is produced with the quality for which Brepols is renowned. Ann Buckley is to be congratulated on doing an excellent job of editing and, as if that were not sufficient, to translate chapters on behalf of colleagues.

Charles Doherty
(Retired) School of History
University College Dublin
charles.doherty@icloud.com